

April 2023

# Unregistered agreement to sell property is admissible in evidence in a suit for specific performance.

A 2 (two) judge bench of the Supreme Court of India ("**Supreme Court**") has in *R. Hemalatha v. Kashthuri*<sup>1</sup> held that an agreement to sell property which is not registered under the provisions of the Registration Act, 1908 ("**Registration Act**") can be admitted as evidence in a suit seeking specific performance of such agreement.

## **Brief Facts**

In 2013, R. Hemalatha ("Appellant") and Kashthuri ("Respondent") executed an agreement to sell an immovable property ("Agreement"). The Respondent i.e., the original Plaintiff instituted a suit in the trial court seeking specific performance of the Agreement against the Appellant i.e., the original Defendant.

Before the trial court, the Appellant/original Defendant contended that the state of Tamil Nadu by way of the Tamil Nadu State Amendment of 2012 ("**State Amendment**") to the Registration Act *inter alia* inserted sub-section (g) to Section 17(1) of the Registration Act which required an agreement relating to the sale of immovable property above a value of INR 100 (Indian Rupees one hundred) to be compulsorily registered. Thus, given that the Agreement for sale was unregistered, the same could not be admitted in evidence. Considering this position, the trial court *inter alia* held that the unregistered Agreement was not admissible in evidence.

Aggrieved by the order of the trial court, the Respondent/original Plaintiff filed a revision petition before the High Court of Madras ("**Madras HC**"). The Madras HC referred to the proviso to Section 49 of the Registration Act and held that an unregistered agreement was admissible as evidence in a suit for specific performance. Accordingly, the Madras HC set aside the order of the trial court and directed that the unregistered Agreement be received in evidence in the suit filed for specific performance.

The Appellant/original Defendant challenged the order of the Madras HC before the Supreme Court *inter alia* on the ground that the unregistered Agreement could not be admitted in evidence given the insertion of sub-section (g) to Section 17(1) of the Registration Act by the State Amendment. It was further contended that in light of the deletion of the explanation to Section 17(2) of the Registration Act by the State Amendment, which provided for exemption of certain documents from registration, the unregistered Agreement cannot be admitted as evidence. The Respondent/original Plaintiff *inter alia* submitted that the proviso to Section 49 of the Registration Act stipulated that an unregistered document affecting the immovable property may be received as evidence of a contract in a suit for specific performance under the Specific Relief Act, 1877<sup>2</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 2023 SCC OnLine 381

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> References to the Specific Relief Act, 1877 under the Registration Act, 1908 are to be read as references to the Specific Relief Act, 1963.

## **Issue**

Whether an unregistered agreement for sale of immovable property could be received in evidence in a suit filed for specific performance in view of the State Amendment effected by the state of Tamil Nadu.

## **Analysis and findings**

While dismissing the appeal, the Supreme Court *inter alia* observed - The Tamil Nadu Amendment Act, 2012 amended Section 17 of the Registration Act to require registration of instruments relating to the sale of immovable property. However, no corresponding change was made to the proviso to Section 49 of the Registration Act which allows unregistered documents affecting immovable property (otherwise required to be registered under the Registration Act or Transfer of Property Act, 1882) to be received as evidence in a suit for specific performance.

#### **JSA Comment**

While this judgment was delivered in the context of a state amendment which required an agreement for sale of property to be registered, the Supreme Court has clarified the broader proposition that an unregistered agreement for sale of property may be admitted in evidence.

## **Real Estate Practice**

JSA is widely recognised as having one of the premier Real Estate Practices in India, and it is one of the most sophisticated & highly diversified commercial Real Estate practices, led by knowledgeable and experienced Real Estate experts at each of our offices in Gurugram, New Delhi, Mumbai, Bangalore and Hyderabad. Our clients use our services for some very challenging and complex Real Estate transactions, which require thoughtful and practical advice.

Our clients comprise a broad cross-section of Indian and International, Institutional & private entities, including Developers, Real Estate advisers, Banks, Real Estate Funds, high net worth Investors, Governments, Major Retailers, Hotel owners & operators and others.

We are primarily involved in legal and regulatory issues for various types of Real Estate projects, including in relation to construction and development of hotels, malls, residential & commercial complexes, warehouses, IT & Industrial Parks and Special Economic Zones. We have been involved in conducting legal due diligence in relation to such projects and have drafted/ reviewed various types of documents including transaction documents such as (a) Shareholders/ Subscription/ Share Purchase Agreements; (b) Development Agreements; (c) Joint Venture Agreements and other related documents/ agreements.

During the course of our practice, we have also been involved in the drafting/reviewing of (a) Agreements for Sale; (b) Conveyance Deeds; and (c) Lease Deeds.

## This Prism has been prepared by:



<u>Farhad Sorabjee</u> Partner



Pratik Pawar Partner



Senior Associate



Ananya Verma Associate



17 Practices and 24 Ranked Lawyers

IFLR1000



16 Practices and 11 Ranked Lawyers



7 Practices and 2 Ranked Lawyers



11 Practices and 39 Ranked Partners IFLR1000 APAC Rankings 2022

Banking & Finance Team of the Year

Fintech Team of the Year

Restructuring & Insolvency
Team of the Year

Among Top 7 Best Overall Law Firms in India and 10 Ranked Practices

13 winning Deals in IBLJ Deals of the Year

-----

10 A List Lawyers in IBLI Top 100 Lawyer List



Banking & Financial Services Law Firm of the Year 2022

Dispute Resolution Law Firm of the Year 2022

Equity Market Deal of the Year (Premium) 2022

Energy Law Firm of the Year 2021



Ranked #1 The Vahura Best Law Firms to Work Report, 2022

Top 10 Best Law Firms for Women in 2022

For more details, please contact km@jsalaw.com

www.jsalaw.com



Ahmedabad | Bengaluru | Chennai | Gurugram | Hyderabad | Mumbai | New Delhi









This prism is not an advertisement or any form of solicitation and should not be construed as such. This prism has been prepared for general information purposes only. Nothing in this prism constitutes professional advice or a legal opinion. You should obtain appropriate professional advice before making any business, legal or other decisions. JSA and the authors of this prism disclaim all and any liability to any person who takes any decision based on this publication.